MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING,
Thursday, August 24, 2017 @ 4:30 p.m.
Five Seasons Conference Room, City Services Center, 500 15th Avenue SW

Members Present:    Mark Stoffer Hunter   Chair
Amanda McKnight-Grafton
Tim Oberbroeckling
Ron Mussman
Barb Westercamp
Caitlin Hartman
Heather Sundermann

Members Absent:    BJ Hobart
Todd McNall

City Staff:                Jeff Hintz, Planner
Iván Gonzalez, Planner
Anne Kroll, Administrative Assistant

Call Meeting to Order
•    Mark Stoffer Hunter called the meeting to order at 4:31 p.m.
•    Seven (7) Commissioners were present with two (2) absent.

1. Public Comment
•    Bob Grafton asked that the Commission place a hold on the property up for demolition at 1708
4th Avenue SE because Habitat for Humanity has interest in moving the property onto a vacant
lot. There is potential for land swapping between two (2) non-profit organizations.

2. Approve Meeting Minutes
•    Ron Mussman made a motion to approve the minutes from August 10, 2017. Barb Westercamp
seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Item 3bi was considered next to accommodate guests.

3. Action Items
b) Certificates of Appropriateness
i. 1316-1320 3rd Avenue SE – Installation of rear yard fence
•    Jeff Hintz stated that this project is for the installation of a six (6) foot chain link fence to match
the existing fence at 1320 3rd Avenue SE. A shed was moved which formed this section of fence
and the request is to fill the fifteen (15) foot gap. This project is also for the installation of a
CertainTeed brand vinyl fence which is six (6) feet high with a gate. This fence will simulate a
cedar surface and be colored a “weathered blend” to match the trim on the adjacent learning
center connected to the church. Mr. Hintz shared photos of the fencing locations as well as a site
plan view and the Historic District Guidelines on fences and the prioritization. Staff recommends approval because no defining feature on any building would be impacted by the proposal, the chain link fencing is necessary for supervisory and safety purposes of the playground, only a fifteen (15) foot section is being fenced, brown fencing blends with the building and is not reflective or shiny, and vinyl fence would screen the maintenance area and accessory buildings, which are not viewed as contributing structures.

- The applicant discussed what updates have been made to the church property and how the fencing fits into those plans. The section of chain link fencing that needs to be filled in is to secure the area for children to play.
- The applicant stated that they looked into wood fencing and decided not to use it because the vinyl was a better option for vandalism. Vandalism is easier to clean off of the vinyl fencing.
- Mr. Oberbroeckling stated that he would rather see chain link by the sheds than the vinyl to match the other fencing. The applicant stated that vinyl fencing conceals the area better than chain link. There have been items stolen out of the sheds and the vinyl fence helps conceal the sheds. Jeff Hintz noted that staff would not recommend chain link for a larger area because chain link is not recommended in the Guidelines.
- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two (2) fences, one (1) chain link and one (1) vinyl, at 1316-1320 3rd Avenue SE because of their location at the back (alley side) of the property and because it is for a small section. Mr. Oberbroeckling noted that if other areas were being fenced in with these materials the application likely would not have been approved. Heather Sundermann seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Amanda McKnight Grafton arrived at the meeting at 5:12 p.m.

a) Demolition Applications

i. 1708 4th Avenue SE - Primary Structure, Private Property
  - Jeff Hintz stated that this property was built in 1920 and is considered eligible under Criteria C in the 1994 Intensive Survey. Staff recommends immediate release. The structure is not in future plans for the property owner as the land is proposed to be included with a day care center.
  - Mark Stoffer Hunter noted that there is historic significance near the house as well.
  - Amanda McKnight Grafton made a motion to place a sixty (60) day hold on the property at 1708 4th Avenue SE so that the opportunity to move the property can be explored. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

ii. 1869 Ellis Boulevard NW – Primary Structure, City Owned Property
  - Iván Gonzalez stated that this property was built in 1956 and was deemed not eligible in the 2009 Reconnaissance Survey. Staff recommends immediate release. The remove of this structure is necessary to allow for the construction of the Flood Control System.
  - Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to approve the demolition of 1869 Ellis Boulevard NW. Barb Westercamp seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

iii. 2120 E Avenue NE – 12x24 Accessory Structure, Private Property
  - Iván Gonzalez stated that this garage was built in 1935. The area was looked at for the 2014 Citywide Survey and was not recommended for intensive survey. Staff recommends immediate release. The building style and character are not consistent with known historical carriage houses in the City.
  - Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to approve the demolition of the accessory structure at 2120 E Avenue NE. Barb Westercamp seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
iv. 1919 Park Avenue SE – 16x20 Accessory Structure, Private Property

- Iván Gonzalez stated that this garage was built in 1922. The area was looked at for the 2014 Citywide Survey and was not recommended for intensive survey. Staff recommends immediate release as the garage has structural issues. The building style and character are not consistent with known historical carriage houses in the City.
- Mark Stoffer Hunter noted that it is not just carriage houses the Commission is looking for but also greenhouses or garlows as well as archeological unity between the home and garage.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton made a motion to approve the demolition of the accessory structure at 1919 Park Avenue SE. Caitlin Hartman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

v. 1242 30th Street SE – 19x22 Accessory Structure, Private Property

- Jeff Hintz stated that this garage was built in 1928. The area was looked at for the 2014 Citywide Survey and was not recommended for intensive survey. Staff recommends immediate release because the garage has termite damage. The applicant plans to rebuild.
- Mark Stoffer Hunter would like to take photos of the garage before demolition.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton made a motion to approve the demolition of the garage at 1242 30th Street SE. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

c) Prioritization of Area Recommended for Intensive Survey

- The seven (7) Commissioners in attendance gave their rankings for the fourteen (14) areas recommended for intensive survey. Discussion was held about Coe College and the surrounding area. The majority of the Commission feels that the greatest threat of demolition is to the neighborhoods surrounding Coe College.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton made a motion to approve the ranking for the prioritization of areas recommended for intensive survey in the Citywide Survey as follows: Coe College area, Vernon Heights, Bever Park and Woods, East Highlands, Ridgewood Addition, County Club Addition, Greene and College First Addition, Midway Park Addition, North Highlands, Northview First Addition, Coon McNeal Development, Mount Mercy Campus, Belmont Park, and Rapids Township. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed with Caitlin Hartman opposing.

4. Discussion Items

a) Update to Historic District Guidelines

- Jeff Hintz stated that the City’s graphic designer has finished the template and that staff is working on adding the guidelines text to the template. When staff is finished the Commission will have a chance to see the document before public outreach takes place.

b) Historic Preservation Commission Bylaws

- Jeff Hintz stated that staff incorporated all of the changes that the Commission asked for at the last meeting. If the Commission is okay with the changes the bylaws will be sent out at least ten (10) days prior to the next meeting so that they can be approved at the September 14, 2017 meeting.
- The Commission did not have any changes at this time.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton thanked staff for listening to the Commission’s thoughts and adding them into the bylaws.

c) Recognition of Outgoing Commissioner
Jeff Hintz thanked Caitlin Hartman for her time on the Commission. The Commissioners expressed their thanks as well.

5. Announcements

- Jeff Hintz stated that there will be an unveiling media event for the signs and posts on September 13, 2017 in front of the Bethel AME Church.
- Barb Westercamp wanted to make sure that the Commission is aware that a few of the historical buildings at Usher’s Ferry will have to be closed down due to accessibility requirements through the ADA.

6. Adjournment

- Barb Westercamp made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:26 p.m. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully Submitted,

Anne Kroll, Administrative Assistant II
Community Development