Call Meeting to Order
- Amanda McKnight-Grafton called the meeting to order at 4:31 p.m.
- Seven (7) Commissioners were present with three (3) absent.

1. Public Comment
- Cindy Hadish stated that the Frankie House is for sale and that there will be a press release and open house. This is the house that came to the Commission for demolition and was placed on hold. The home has since been moved and renovated.

2. Approve Meeting Minutes
- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to approve the minutes from March 9, 2017. Sam Bergus seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

3. Action Items
   a) Certificate of Appropriateness
      i. 1638 3rd Avenue SE – Construction of a single-family home and accessory structure
         - Bob Grafton and Amanda McKnight-Grafton recused themselves from discussion and voting.
         - Jeff Hintz stated that the HPC previewed this project at the February 23, 2017 meeting and the Commission expressed concerns regarding vinyl siding, supported the detached
garage design, and noted the importance of contextual front yard setbacks. Proposed materials include LP Smart Side on the home and garage, vinyl windows, fiberglass front door, and aluminum soffit and fascia. Mr. Hintz shared the site plan and all elevations. The applicant provided samples of the materials. Mr. Hintz reviewed the Historic District Guidelines for streetscapes; the SOI Standards for Rehabilitation; and the analysis for Massing, Form, and Design and Materials which are all consistent with the Guidelines. In summary, the design, form, style, massing, and setbacks match the existing neighborhood, the home is unlikely to add historic value but it does not detract from the historical context, this project addresses a gap within an otherwise intact block with strengthens the historic streetscape, and it is consistent with SOI standards and Guidelines. Staff recommends approval of the project because it has consistent mass, form, setbacks and style with the surrounding homes; consistent with the intent of the Guidelines and SOI standards; consistent with the City’s Comprehensive Plan; and accounts for feedback given by HPC during the preview.

- Tim Oberbroeckling does not think that the vinyl windows should be approved because the Commission is setting precedence for others who apply for vinyl windows. The applicant stated that for Habitat for Humanity to build this without vinyl windows among other things add so much cost. Todd McNall noted that everyone that comes in has a budget. Sam Bergus stated that this is not the only point of precedence for every single future project or every project done before.

- Caitlin Hartman does not like the design of the home as it looks like a development home and does not fit into the neighborhood. Ron Mussman agreed, but does not think it should match exactly. Todd McNall stated that when you put an addition on a historic building, the historic briefs do not want the addition to exactly match the historic building because you want to be able to tell that it is an addition and new construction in comparison to the original. Mr. McNall also pointed out that the homes in this neighborhood are all different and that there are four story homes and bungalows next door to each other.

- Ron Mussman stated that he did not approve of the LP Smart Siding. Tim Oberbroekling agreed that he did not like the siding. Todd McNall stated that it is technically a wood product and it has a 50 year warranty. Tim Oberbroekling questioned the use of another wood product that was presented by a Commissioner at a previous meeting. The applicant said he looked into that product and it was more expensive than the LP Smart Siding.

- The Commission discussed using vinyl windows on all sides of the house except the front. Tim Oberbroeckling stated that if he was building this house he would not want that; he would want all the windows to be the same.

- The applicant stated that when you go into a neighborhood and are going to build a home you are going to have that taxable value of your home and the neighborhood sets the price of what the home is worth. If you set a standard so high to build to the top tier is that home going to be to the value to build it at? You do not want to build a home for someone that is going to cost them a lot more than it is worth because of what is beside it.

- Tim Oberbroeckling again shared concerns about vinyl windows and setting the precedence for future projects. Todd McNall stated that SHPO allowed aluminum-clad wood windows on the Brown Apartments (1234 4th Avenue SE).

- Tim Oberbroeckling also has an issue with the fiberglass entry door. Jeff Hintz stated that the Commission approved fiberglass doors, similar to the proposal, at 1417 and 1427 3rd Avenue SE.

- Jeff Hintz stated that if a future applicant came to staff wanting vinyl windows because this property had them, that staff would tell them that this property is new construction
and non-contributing to the District; they are unlike scenarios, not every property is the same.

- Tim Oberbroeckling is concerned that when staff recommends approval of the project that gives the applicant false hope. Jeff Hintz stated that he lets the applicant know that it is ultimately the Commission’s decision. Tim Oberbroeckling also stated that he wished staff would have brought this project to the HPC earlier for their review. Staff mentioned that was the purpose of the HPC preview on February 27.

- Caitlin Hartman suggested assigning a Commission liaison to the project.

- Sam Bergus made a motion to approve the COA for the construction of a single-family home and accessory structure at 1638 3rd Avenue SE with the stipulation of having to approve the windows separately. There was not a second and it did not pass.

- The Commission discussed different options with the applicant such as starting the foundation until the Commission makes a decision. The applicant does not want to start anything until the entire project has been approved.

- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to table the project and have a liaison work with the applicant. Caitlin Hartman seconded the motion. Sam Bergus does not think that this motion will help and that Commissioners will still have different opinions.

- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to deny the COA for the construction of a single-family home and accessory structure at 1638 3rd Avenue SE because of the materials. Caitlin Hartman seconded the motion. The motion passed with Tim Oberbroeckling, Caitlin Hartman, and Ron Mussman approving, Sam Bergus opposing, and Todd McNall abstaining.

- The Commission discussed whether the LP Smart Side is real wood or not.

- The Commission requested that Bob Grafton and Mark Stoffer Hunter work with the applicant.

b) Funding Consideration – Historic Rehab Program

i. 209 Park Court SE – Painting of the structure

- Jeff Hintz stated that this project is for painting the exterior of the home including the trim and prep work. Two (2) bids were obtained. Mr. Hintz shared pictures of the property. Staff recommends approval of funding for the project because the project is eligible for the program, consistent with the District Guidelines, architectural detailing is not being removed, there is no impact on defining features, and this project keeps the structure in use and good repair.

- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to approve funding for painting the house at 209 Park Court SE. Todd McNall seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

c) Section 106 Review – Right-of-way adjacent to 1972 B Avenue NE

- Jeff Hintz stated the project is to place a small cell facility on existing utility pole in the B Avenue NE Historic District and that the Commission can provide comments on the project. Mr. Hintz shared a location map and a picture of the cell facility looks like. Staff recommends that the Commission make comment that the project be completed as presented because there is minimal impact to surrounding properties and it is consistent with existing facilities in Cedar Rapids Historic Districts.

- Todd McNall made a motion to approve that the Commission had no comments about the Section 106 review for the cell facility at the right-of-way adjacent to 1972 B Avenue NE. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
d) Demolition Applications under Review
   i. 909 16th Avenue SE – Private Property
      • Bob Grafton stated that there are multiple parties interested in moving the house and that the property should remain on hold.

4. Discussion Items
   a) Infill Opportunities and Design Considerations in the Local Historic Districts
      • The Commission discussed single-family, multi-family, and vacant lot zoning restrictions.
      • The Commission again discussed the COA project that was not approved. Amanda McKnight Grafton stated that the Commission should have a list of approved products for different situations that can be given to applicants. The applicants are coming to the Commission to fix their properties and they should not be discouraged in doing so.

5. Announcements
   • There were no announcements.

6. Adjournment
   • Todd McNall made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:48 p.m. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully Submitted,

Anne Kroll, Administrative Assistant II
Community Development